Engagement Master Class:
Conceptual & Theoretical Underpinnings of Engaged Scholarship

Lorilee R. Sandmann, Ph.D.
Emerging Engagement Scholars Workshop
Oct. 5, 2008

the Scholarship of Engagement as An Imperative for Colleges & universities of the 21st century

“Engagement implies strenuous, thoughtful, argumentative interaction with the non-university world in at least four spheres: setting universities’ aims, purposes, and priorities; relating teaching and learning to the wider world; the back-and-forth dialogue between researchers and practitioners; and taking on wider responsibilities as neighbours and citizens.”

Association of Commonwealth Universities

L. R. Sandmann © 2008
“Engagement is a principle that applies widely to nearly all social institutions….Engagement isn’t just the ethical or right thing to do, it is also critical to an institution’s long-term survival and success”

William Richardson, W.K. Kellogg Foundation
A Shared Legacy of Engagement, 2004

The conversation...

- **Historical Underpinnings for Engagement**
  - The Context and Case for Engagement

- **Conceptual and Theoretical Underpinning for Engaged Scholarship**
  - The Context and Case for Engaged Scholarship
Why Engagement in H.E.?

The Civic Purpose of Higher Education

"Unless education has some frame of reference it is bound to be aimless, lacking a unified objective. The necessity for a frame of reference must be admitted. There exists in this country such a unified frame. It is called democracy."

John Dewey (1937)

Engagement Landscape

- Punctuations—Evolved into a multifaceted field
- Engagement Defined
- Engagement as Teaching, Research, Econ. Dev.
- Engagement as a Scholarly Expression
- Engagement Institutionalized & Socialized
Engagement Pathways

The Civic Mission of Higher Education

Mission Pathway

Improved Teaching and Learning
Pedagogical Pathway

Scholarship of Engagement

Connecting to the Community
Partnership Pathway

The New Production of Knowledge
Epistemological Pathway

John Saltmarsh, Ph.D.
NERCHE, UMass- Boston

L. R. Sandmann © 2008
Engagement Defined

- Substantiating the need for higher education’s engagement with the communities
- Defining characteristics, values, principles
- Emphasizing bidirectional interactions, reciprocity, and mutual respect to expand the traditional concept of outreach, public service

Carnegie Classification...

Community Engagement describes the collaboration between higher education institutions and their larger communities (local, regional/state, national, global) for the mutually beneficial exchange of knowledge and resources in a context of partnership and reciprocity.

Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching, 2006
Carnegie Classification...

New Elective Engagement Classification—
76 institutions selected for classification

- Institutional Identity
- Institutional Commitment
  - Curricular Engagement
  - Outreach and Partnerships

http://www.carnegiefoundation.org/Classification/index.htm

Accreditation Commissions...

Criterion Five: Engagement and Service
As called for by its mission, the organization identifies its constituencies and serves them in ways both value.
University engagement is direct, two-way interaction with external constituencies through the development, exchange, and application of knowledge, information, and expertise for mutual benefit. Engagement activities may be initiated by community partners or by University faculty, staff, or students.

Service is an initiative generated by the institution or institutional representatives in which knowledge, information, and expertise is provided for the benefit of external constituencies. Service initiatives may be generated in response to requests from an external constituent, but do not imply a mutually beneficial exchange.

Service Outreach Engagement

Degree of academic/intellectual influence and influence of partners
### A Typology of Institutional Responses to the Scholarship of Engagement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Primary Educational Mission</th>
<th>Definition of Engagement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Liberal arts college</td>
<td>Citizenship training for democracy</td>
<td>Engaging with ideas of value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Character formation</td>
<td>Training citizens for public life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research university</td>
<td>Expanding the knowledge base</td>
<td>Applying knowledge to solve social problems and issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional school</td>
<td>Teaching applied, concrete skills</td>
<td>Training professionals to perform needed social functions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community college</td>
<td>Providing access to nontraditional populations</td>
<td>Clinical training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Access to ed. opport. Training to employ.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

L. R. Sandmann © 2008

---

### Not everything is...

- Engagement
- Effective Engagement
- Scholarly Engagement
  - what is quality
  - what is worth rewarding
  - how is it assessed
- Scholarship about Engagement
New Approaches to Knowledge Production and Research

- Mode I – traditional – pure, disciplinary, homogeneous, expert-led, hierarchical, peer reviewed, university-based
- Mode II – applied, problem-centered, transdisciplinary social and economic contexts, heterogeneous, hybrid, demand-driven, entrepreneurial, network-embedded, not necessarily led by universities

Gibbons, et al. (1994)

Quadrant Model of Scientific Research

Research is inspired by:  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Consideration of use?</th>
<th>Quest for fundamental understanding?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Pure basic research (Bohr)
- Use-inspired research (Pasteur)
- Pure applied research (Edison)

Stokes, D. (1997). *Pasteur’s quadrant*
## Scholarship Compared

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TRADITIONAL</th>
<th>ENGAGED SCHOLARSHIP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>breaks new ground in the discipline</td>
<td>breaks new ground in the discipline and has direct application to broader public issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>answers significant questions in the discipline</td>
<td>answers significant questions in the discipline which have relevance to public or community issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>is reviewed and validated by qualified peers in the discipline</td>
<td>is reviewed and validated by qualified peers in the discipline and members of the community</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

### Principles of Engagement + Standards of Scholarship = Engaged Scholarship
What is Scholarly Engagement?

- Scholarship – What

- Engaged Scholarship – How

- For the Common, Public Good – Toward What End

What is Scholarship?

- Scholarship is original intellectual work which is communicated and the significance is validated by peers. Scholarship may emerge from teaching, research or other responsibilities. Scholarship may take the many forms including, but not limited to: research contributing to a body of knowledge, development of new technology, materials, or methods; integration of knowledge or technology leading to new interpretations or applications; creation and interpretation in the arts.

Oregon State University, 1999
Engaged Scholarship

- Scholarship—practices that cut across the categories of academic scholarship (discovery, teaching, application & integration) +
- Engagement—reciprocal, collaborative relationships with partners external to the university. (Boyer, 1996)

- Scholarly engagement consists of
  - Research, teaching, integration and application scholarship that
  - Incorporates reciprocal practices of civic engagement into the production of knowledge. (Barker, 2004)

Engaged Scholarship

- Collaborative and participatory
- Draws on many sources of distributed knowledge; based on partnerships
- Shaped by multiple perspectives and expectations
- Deals with difficult, evolving questions
- Long term in both effort and impact
- Requires diverse strategies and approaches; crosses disciplinary lines
Scholarly Engagement

Scholarly Engagement is the creation, integration, application and transmission of knowledge for the benefits of external audiences and the University and occurs in all areas of the University Mission: research, teaching and service. The quality and value of Scholarly Engagement is determined by academic peers and community partners.

UMass Faculty Senate Outreach Council, 2006

Engaged Scholarship via Disciplines

- Public Sociology (Burawoy, 2004, 2005)
- Public Scholarship (Peters, 2005)
- Community Engaged Scholarship in Health Professions (CCPH, 2005)
- Engaged Scholarship (Van de Ven, 2007)
- Others--transdisciplinary, translational…CA, UK, Australia
Engaged Scholarship

- Scholarly boundary crossing

- Scholarship in engagement
  - Scholarly engagement *in* teaching
  - Scholarly engagement *in* research
  - Scholarly engagement *in* service
  - Scholarship guided by an engagement ethos—connect in coherent, thematic, scholarly ways


L. R. Sandmann © 2008
Architecture of engaged Scholarship: 
*Same Questions, Different Answers*

- Purpose
- Questions
- Research Design
- Data Analysis
- Dissemination

Sandmann (2007)

Degree of Collaborative Processes in Engaged Scholarship

- HIGH DEGREE – DETERMINED MUTUALLY
- LOW DEGREE – DETERMINED UNILATERALLY BY ONE PARTNER
Outcomes of Engaged Scholarship

ACADEMIC IMPACT

ADVANCES IN KNOWLEDGE, PUBLICATIONS, ETC.

COMMUNITY IMPACT

ALTERED COMMUNITY, PRACTICE, AND/OR PUBLIC POLICY CHANGE, ETC.

A

HIGH ACADEMIC IMPACT
LOW/INDIRECT COMMUNITY IMPACT

B

LOW ACADEMIC IMPACT
LOW/INDIRECT COMMUNITY IMPACT

C

HIGH ACADEMIC IMPACT
LOW/INDIRECT COMMUNITY IMPACT

Quality—Evaluation Criteria

- Goals/questions
- Context of theory, literature, best practices
- Methods
- Results
- Communication/dissemination
- Reflective critique

National Review Board Scholarship of Engagement, 2001

L. R. Sandmann © 2008
Scholarly Engagement

- Way to think about work
- Way to frame
- Way to implement
- Way to assess
- Way to communicate

Your Effort--Two Questions

Is it Engagement?  Is it scholarship?
Assessment of Scholarly Engagement

- Is this an "engagement" effort? To what extent does this project/portfolio/dossier provide evidence of "quality" engaged scholarship? What is its:
  - Significance
  - Community collaboration resulting in mutual benefit
  - Scholarly and intellectual contribution
  - Impact/"broader impacts"

Continuous Collaboration with External Partner

Continuous Reflection
Feedback, and Adaptation

Purpose Process Outcomes
Issues with Institutionalization of Engaged Scholarship

- Disorganizes an institution organized around the disciplines
- Warrants interdisciplinarity when there are not structures
- Warrants team work when reward structures focus on individuals
- Requires institutional adaptation
- Expects democratic processes and lessons from a non-democratic institution

Shifts in Faculty Work

From
- Provider (faculty) driven
- Autonomous
- Discipline-based
- Ivory tower
- Quality based on how much you have

To
- Learning driven
- Collaborative
- Interdisciplinary
- Civic Engagement
- Quality based on how much you contribute